# DEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of the Application of Grain Belt Express	)
Clean Line LLC for a Certificate of Convenience and	
Necessity Authorizing it to Construct, Own, Operate,	) File No. EA-2016-0358
Control, Manage and Maintain a High Voltage, Direct	)
Current Transmission Line and an Associated Converter	
Station Providing an Interconnection on the Maywood -	
Montgomery 345kV Transmission Line	)

#### ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Issue Date: December 27, 2016 Effective Date: December 27, 2016

On August 30, 2016, Grain Belt Express Clean Line LLC ("Grain Belt Express") filed an application with the Missouri Public Service Commission ("Commission") for a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity to construct, own, operate, control, manage and maintain a high voltage, direct current transmission line and associated facilities within Buchanan, Clinton, Caldwell, Carroll, Chariton, Randolph, Monroe and Ralls Counties, Missouri, as well as an associated converter station in Ralls County.

The Missouri Landowners Alliance ("MLA") issued data requests to Grain Belt Express and the Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission seeking information regarding communications between prospective purchasers of energy transmitted over the proposed transmission line and descriptions of pricing calculations included in their request for information responses. On December 13, 2016, Infinity Wind Power ("Infinity") requested that the Commission issue a protective order to prohibit the disclosure of Infinity's commercially-sensitive business information to any party in this proceeding.

Commission rules provide for the issuance of protective orders when necessary to protect information from discovery more rigorously than would be provided from a highly confidential designation. Missouri Supreme Court Rule 56.01(c) states that protective orders may be issued "to protect a party or person from annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, or undue burden or expense, including...that a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be disclosed only in a designated way". Where confidential information is being sought, especially from non-parties, the burden is on the party seeking discovery to show that the probative value of the information outweighs the harm disclosure would cause to the person from whom the information is sought.

Ten days have elapsed and no party has objected to Infinity's motion for a protective order.<sup>3</sup> The Commission finds that disclosure of the requested information would be harmful to Infinity's business interests. Release of that information would negatively impact Infinity's ability to negotiate by providing a competitive advantage to others to the detriment of Infinity. Disclosing this commercially-sensitive information would have a chilling effect on intervention and participation by the wind industry in similar future proceedings. Designation of this information as highly confidential, which permits disclosure to a party's attorneys and expert witnesses, would not adequately protect the information because once that information is known to other persons it could be utilized in the future in other

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Commission Rule 4 CSR 240-2.135(6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Litton Industries, Inc. v. Chesapeake & Ohio Railway Company, 129 F.R.D. 528, 530 (E.D.Wis. 1990), analyzing Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), which is substantially similar to Mo. Sup. Ct. R. 56.01(c). The federal district court in *Litton* held that some confidential information could not be discovered where disclosure would provide an advantage to a non-party's competitors and harm the non-party's customer relations. "[F]ederal precedent concerning that [federal] rule...is a persuasive guide for the construction of Rule 56.01(c)". Stortz by Stortz v. Seier, 835 S.W. 2d 540, 541 (Mo. App. 1992).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Commission rule 4 CSR 240-2.080(13) provides that parties shall be allowed ten days from the date of filing in which to respond to any pleading unless otherwise ordered by the Commission.

forums. The Commission finds that the probative value of the information requested in the MLA data requests is outweighed by the harm that disclosure would cause to Infinity. So, the Commission will grant the unopposed motion for a protective order.

#### THE COMMISSION ORDERS THAT:

- 1. The motion for a protective order filed by Infinity Wind Power on December 13, 2016, is granted.
  - 2. This order shall be effective when issued.



BY THE COMMISSION

Porris L Woodryf

Morris L. Woodruff Secretary

Michael Bushmann, Senior Regulatory Law Judge, by delegation of authority pursuant to Section 386.240, RSMo 2000.

Dated at Jefferson City, Missouri, on this 27<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2016.

#### STATE OF MISSOURI

#### OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

I have compared the preceding copy with the original on file in this office and I do hereby certify the same to be a true copy therefrom and the whole thereof.

WITNESS my hand and seal of the Public Service Commission, at Jefferson City, Missouri, this 27<sup>th</sup> day of December 2016.

SION OF THE OF T

Morris L. Woodruff

**Secretary** 

## MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION December 27, 2016

#### File/Case No. EA-2016-0358

#### Missouri Public Service Commission

Staff Counsel Department 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360

### Jefferson City, MO 65102 staffcounselservice@psc.mo.gov

#### Office of the Public Counsel

James Owen 200 Madison Street, Suite 650 P.O. Box 2230 Jefferson City, MO 65102 opcservice@ded.mo.gov

#### Charles Henke

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### **Consumers Council of** Missouri

John B Coffman 871 Tuxedo Blvd. St. Louis, MO 63119-2044 john@johncoffman.net

#### Grain Belt Express Clean Line, LLC Grain Belt Express Clean Line, Lisa A Gilbreath LLC

254 Commercial Street Portland, ME 64111-0410 lgilbreath@pierceatwood.com

Joshua Harden 4520 Main Street, Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64111 joshua.harden@dentons.com

#### Grain Belt Express Clean Line, IBEW Local Union 2 LLC

Karl Zobrist 4520 Main Street, Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64111 karl.zobrist@dentons.com

Sherrie Hall 7730 Carondelet Ave., Ste. 200 St. Louis, MO 63105 sahall@hammondshinners.com

#### **IBEW Local Union 2**

Emily Perez 7730 Carondelet Ave., Suite 200 St. Louis, MO 63105 eperez@hammondshinners.com

#### **IBEW Local Union No. 53**

Sherrie Hall 7730 Carondelet Ave., Ste. 200 St. Louis, MO 63105 sahall@hammondshinners.com

#### **IBEW Local Union No. 53**

Emily Perez 7730 Carondelet Ave., Suite 200 St. Louis, MO 63105 eperez@hammondshinners.com

#### **Infinity Wind Power**

Terri Pemberton 3321 SW 6th Ave Topeka, KS 66606 terri@caferlaw.com

#### **Matthew and Christina** Reichert

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### Missouri AFL-CIO

James Faul 4399 Laclede Ave., St. Louis, MO 63108 ifaul@hghllc.net

#### Missouri Department of **Economic Development**

Alexander Antal 10 Clinton Dr., Unit A Columbia, MO 65203-6520 Alexander.Antal@ded.mo.gov

#### Missouri Farm Bureau

Brent E Haden 827 E Broadway Columbia, MO 65201 brent@hadenlaw.com

#### Missouri Industrial Energy Consumers (MIEC)

Diana M Vuylsteke 211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102 dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

#### Missouri Joint Municipal **Electric Utility Commission**

Douglas Healy 3010 E. Battlefield, Suite A Springfield, MO 65804 doug@healylawoffices.com

#### Missouri Joint Municipal **Electric Utility Commission**

Penny Speake 3010 E. Battlefield, Suite A Springfield, MO 65804 penny@healylawoffices.com

#### Missouri Landowners Alliance

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### Missouri Public Service Commission

Nathan Williams 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 nathan.williams@psc.mo.gov

#### Missouri Retailers Association Natural Resources Defense

Diana M Vuvlsteke 211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102 dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

# Council

Henry B Robertson 319 N. Fourth St., Suite 800 St. Louis, MO 63102 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

#### R. Kenneth Hutchinson

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### Randall Meyer

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### Renew Missouri

Andrew J Linhares 1200 Rogers Street, Suite B Columbia, MO 65201-4744 Andrew@renewmo.org

#### Robyn Henke

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### **Rockies Express Pipeline**

Colly J Durley 111 S. Ninth St., Suite 200 P.O. Box 918 Columbia, MO 65205-0918 Durley@smithlewis.com

#### **Rockies Express Pipeline**

Sarah E Gibonev 111 South Ninth Street, Suite 200 P.O. Box 918 Columbia, MO 65205-0918 giboney@smithlewis.com

#### Roseanne Meyer

Paul A Agathen 485 Oak Field Ct. Washington, MO 63090 paa0408@aol.com

#### **Show Me Concerned** Landowners

David C Linton 314 Romaine Spring View Fenton, MO 63026 Jdlinton@reagan.com

#### Sierra Club

Henry B Robertson 319 N. Fourth St., Suite 800 St. Louis, MO 63102 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

#### The Wind Coalition

Sean Brady PO Box 4072 Wheaton, IL 60189-4072 sbrady@windonthewires.org

#### The Wind Coalition

Deirdre K Hirner 2603 Huntleigh Place Jefferson City, MO 65109 dhirner@awea.org

#### Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. David Woodsmall

807 Winston Court Jefferson City, MO 65101 david.woodsmall@woodsmalllaw.com sbrady@windonthewires.org

#### Wind on the Wires

Sean Brady PO Box 4072 Wheaton, IL 60189-4072

#### Wind on the Wires

Deirdre K Hirner 2603 Huntleigh Place Jefferson City, MO 65109 dhirner@awea.org

Enclosed find a certified copy of an Order or Notice issued in the above-referenced matter(s).

Sincerely,

Morris L. Woodruff

Secretary

Recipients listed above with a valid e-mail address will receive electronic service. Recipients without a valid e-mail address will receive paper service.