Public Interest
Written Rebuttal
Testimony
Mary Frances
Scholl
Terry and Mary
Frances Scholl
EA-2021-0087
August 24, 2021

MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION FILE NO. EA-2021-0087

WRITTEN REBUTTAL TESTIMONY

OF

MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

ON BEHALF OF

TERRY LIN AND MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

August 24, 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION	3
II. THE SCHOLL PROPERTY	4
III. THE SCHOLLS' INTEREST	$\overline{7}$
A. Compromise Private Property Rights	9
B. Diminish Land and Home Values 1	0
C. Destroy Previous Investments 1	2
D. Impairment of Contracts 1	
IV. ATXI'S STANDARDS AND PROCEDURES ARE INSUFFICIENT 1	3
V. THE SCHOLLS' RECOMMENDATIONS	5

1 I. INTRODUCTION

2	Q.	Please state your name and address.
3	А.	Mary Frances Scholl.
4	Q.	What is your spouse's name?
5	А.	Terry "Lin" Scholl.
6	Q.	What is your occupation?
7	А.	I am retired. Prior to my retirement, I served in the United
8	States Air	Force for 20 years, then worked for Southeast Missouri State
9	University	v for 8 years as an administrative assistant. I am also a full-time
10	homemake	er, and until recently provided assistance to both of my parents as
11	well as my	father-in-law as they aged.
12	Q.	What is your home address?
12 13	Q. A.	What is your home address? 633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is
	A.	
13	A.	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is
13 14	A. located on Q .	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-000-002.00000.
13 14 15	A. located on Q. Convenie	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-000-002.00000. Are you familiar with the application for Certificate of
13 14 15 16	A. located on Q. Convenie	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-000-002.00000. Are you familiar with the application for Certificate of ence and Necessity ("CCN") filed by Ameren Transmission
13 14 15 16 17	A. located on Q. Convenie Company A.	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-002.00000. Are you familiar with the application for Certificate of ence and Necessity ("CCN") filed by Ameren Transmission of Illinois (ATXI) for the "Limestone Ridge Project"?
13 14 15 16 17 18	A. located on Q. Convenie Company A. approxima	633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg, Missouri 63732. The home is Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-002.00000. Are you familiar with the application for Certificate of ence and Necessity ("CCN") filed by Ameren Transmission of Illinois (ATXI) for the "Limestone Ridge Project"? Yes. I am familiar with the proposal to construct a new,

1

Q. What is the purpose of your rebuttal testimony?

A. The purpose of my testimony is to respond to the Application for
a CCN and Direct Testimony filed by ATXI. My testimony summarizes
concerns about the proposed Project. I also explain why the Commission
should impose certain conditions on the CCN, should it issue a CCN in order
to preserve the interests of landowners.

Q. Have you testified previously before the Missouri Public
8 Service Commission?

9 A. No.

10 II. THE SCHOLL PROPERTY

Q. How long have you lived at 633 Chestnut Oak Lane in
Altenburg?

A. We constructed our home in 2016-2017 and have resided there
since August 2017.

Q. In addition to the parcel on which your home sits, what
other parcels do you own?

17 A. We own five total adjacent parcels, totaling 330 acres ("The

18 Property"). The proposed route will directly impact three parcels: 19-1.0-012-

- 19 000-000-008.00000, 19-6.0-013-000-000-003.00000, and 19-6.0-013-000-000-
- 20 013.00000. The proposed route is less than 250 feet to the northwest of the

Ρ

parcel with our primary residence (19-6.0-013-000-002.00000). See
 attached, Schedule MS-1.

3 Q. Why did you choose to construct your residence at this
4 site?

A. Our home was built upon the footprint of a previous farmhouse that stood on this ground for more than a century. We delight in the four seasons and the circle of wildlife as they "play out" across the hills, the bottom ground and in the front and back yards outside our windows. The crops, the trees (hand planted 20 years ago), the sky, and the weather are all hard-earned blessings we worked hard to attain and want to relish in our retirement years.

12

Q. How long have you owned the Property?

A. We have owned the property for more than 20 years. We
originally purchased approximately 250 acres in 2001, and later, in 2019,
purchased approximately 80 additional acres. The Property not only contains
our primary residence, but we utilize approximately 70 acres for agriculture,
while other areas have been preserved primarily for hunting, timber
harvesting and outdoor activity.

19 Q. Prior to the construction of your home, what was your
20 relation to the property?

 $\mathbf{5}$

- 1 A. My husband has hunted on this property for more than fifty 2 years. His father and grandfather lived on the property as tenants in the 3 1930s and 1940s. Several of his aunts were born on this farm.
- 4

Q. Tell us more about Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-000-

5 **002.00000**.

6 This is where our primary residence is located. The property also А. 7 contains other structures including a 150-year-old pinned barn. The fields on 8 this parcel are terraced for agricultural use. The property includes several trees in excess of 150 years old. In addition, the southern portion of the 9 10 property contains a habitat restoration wetland project which we spent time 11 and resources in collaboration with the Missouri Department of Conservation 12to complete and maintain. This parcel has caves, a natural spring, and we 13have found Native American artifacts in these fields.

14 Q. Tell us more about Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-00015 003.00000.

A. This parcel includes the driveway to our home. We planted 22 Chestnut Oaks (now mature) along our driveway in 2001. This driveway is our only ingress and egress to our home. In addition, the driveway provides the only ingress and egress to one of our pastures, where we have hay growing. There is also a 150-year-old tree on the property. A newer shed was built on this parcel in 2016. There is also a large sinkhole on this parcel,

Р

which we worked with the Missouri Department of Conservation to clean up
 approximately 20 years ago.

3 Q. Tell us more about Parcel Number 19-6.0-013-000-0004 013.00000.

5 A. This parcel is largely used for agriculture. There are two man-6 made terraces to control soil erosion. This parcel is our "main entrance" to the 7 farm. There is a small "branch" or stream running east southeast on the 8 north side of the parcel.

9 Q. Tell us more about Parcel Number 19-1.0-012-000-00010 008.00000.

11 A. This parcel is planted with native trees, as part of a Missouri 12 Department of Conservation project to improve riparian filter strips. We have 13 invested significant time and resources in creating and preserving habitat for 14 wildlife on our Property, particularly on this parcel. There are no buildings 15 on this parcel, but Brazeau Creek runs through this parcel.

16 III. THE SCHOLLS' INTEREST

Q.

17

Why have you intervened in this case?

A. We first learned we would be potentially impacted by the project in October 2020. We have been doing our very best to read all of the information provided by ATXI, attend any information sessions, and ask

 $\mathbf{7}$

questions. We learned nearly every proposed route would directly impact our
 Property.

3	The final route affects 70 parcels of land, owned by 48 different
4	landowners. Hiser Direct, 7:19-20. We have intervened in this case because
5	we are one of the 48 landowners affected, with four of the seventy impacted
6	parcels. One of the four impacted parcels includes our primary residence.
7	While the Company has been focused on "reliability" (with which we do
8	not have a problem) and economic development, the Company often ignores
9	the direct and significant impact the Project will have on private property
10	owners, wildlife, and natural resources, such as caves and karsts, water
11	sources, and trees.
12	While we recognize the constraints placed on the process by Covid-19,
13	we have been disappointed by the lack of opportunities for landowners to
14	discuss this issue face-to-face with both the companies involved and with
15	Commissioners, Staff and the Office of Public Counsel through the public
16	hearing process.
17	Q. Are you opposed to the application for a Certificate of

- 18 Convenience and Necessity (CCN) by ATXI?
- A. Unless the Commission imposes certain conditions in relation to
 the Project, we are very much opposed. We respectfully ask the Commission

8

1	to deny ATXI's request for a CCN as not in the public interest, unless the	
2	Commissio	on imposes certain conditions as described herein.
3	Q.	Have you reviewed the direct testimony of Sean Black
4	regarding	g the public interest?
5	А.	Yes. I was disappointed that his testimony (Black Direct, 20:7-17)
6	failed to a	ddress the interest of the property owners directly affected by the
7	Project. I a	am pleased with my current utility service and have not had any
8	issues witl	n respect to reliability.
9	Q.	What concerns do you have about the Project?
10	А.	We are concerned that the Commission's approval of the
11	transmissi	on line will:
12	(1) c	ompromise our constitutionally protected private property rights;
13	(2) ii	mpair existing contracts involving the Property;
14	(3) d	estroy previous investments in the Property; and
15	(4) d	iminish land and home values.
16	(A)	COMPROMISE PRIVATE PROPERTY RIGHTS
17	Q.	Specifically, what rights are you concerned you will be
18	forced to	give up if ATXI is granted a CCN?
19	А.	We are particularly concerned that ATXI is requesting a
20	permanen	t easement. We believe a shorter term with a right of renewal is

9

appropriate and would provide greater protection of private property rights. 1 $\mathbf{2}$ We are concerned we will be forced to give up rights, including but not 3 limited to: (1) The ability to set the price for the land; 4 (2) The loss of present enjoyment and use of the land; 5 6 (3) The loss of future enjoyment and land use options: 7 (4) The fragmentation of parcels of land by the easement; and (5) The loss of timber and wildlife. 8 9 What are your concerns regarding the Easement Q. 10 **Agreement**? 11 A. The Easement Agreement (Hiser Direct, CH-02) is written to 12favor and protect ATXI. It should be revised to protect private property rights 13and ensure just compensation to landowners. We also do not believe a 14permanent easement is necessary. **(B) DIMINISH LAND AND HOME VALUES** 1516Q. What is another reason for opposing the transmission 17line? 18 A. We are concerned that the Commission's approval of the transmission line will adversely impact home and land values, which we have 1920striven to improve over more than 20 years.

10

Q. How will the transmission line affect the value of your
 property?

3 We do not know exactly how the transmission line will affect our А. 4 property, except to know it will become less attractive aesthetically and we likely will suffer financially. Not only does the transmission line have the 5 6 potential to harm the environment and wildlife on the Property, but it also 7 significantly damages the aesthetic beauty and viewscapes of our Property. 8 Damage to property value is more significant the closer the transmission line 9 is to a residence, and in this case, it is extremely close to our primary 10 residence.

11

Q. What will be the dollar amount of the reduction?

A. We are not sure at this time the extent to which it will devaluethe property.

14 Q. Do you have examples of the negative impact of high-

- 15 voltage direct current line on home values?
- 16 A. We are aware of an article in which homes where a HDVC line
- 17 was installed near the homes were sold at discounts of \$70,000 or more.¹

Ρ

¹ See Tsawwassen homes selling fast: BC Hydo, CBC News, July 21, 2010, accessed August 2021, https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/tsawwassen-homes-selling-fast-bc-hydro-1.961436.

Another article suggests proximity to power lines can decrease property
 values 10-40%.²

3	(C) DESTROY PREVIOUS INVESTMENTS
4	Q. What are your concerns regarding the destruction of
5	previous investment in the Property?
6	A. ATXI witness Dan Schmidt (in Schedule DS-01) identified
7	Brazeau Creek as already impaired. We are concerned about additional
8	impairment from construction processes.
9	We are concerned about the 150-year-old trees we have endeavored to
10	preserve and concerned about the Chestnut Oaks we planted along our
11	driveway.
12	We are concerned about the land which we have developed for
13	agriculture use.
14	We are concerned about damage to the ingress and egress portions of
15	our property (more than one area is served by a single ingress and egress).
16	We are concerned about damage to karst or cave areas which we have

17 worked to clean up and preserve.

² Buying House Next to Power Lines and How it Affects Resale, Gustan Cho Associates, January 18, 2021, accessed August 2021, https://gustancho.com/buying-house-next-to-power-lines.

We are concerned about impacts to the local environment, including
 underground water resources -- since our land is mostly used for agriculture
 and hunting.

We also have significant concerns about the increased risk of wildfires
as a result of the Project.

6

(D)

IMPAIRMENT OF CONTRACTS

Q. Are there other reasons why you oppose the transmission
8 line?

9 A. Yes. We currently contract with another individual to conduct 10 farming on the property. We have worked with this lease farmer and his son 11 for more than 15 years. It is the primary income source for our Property and 12 we are very concerned that the Project will result in less productivity as well 13 as less interest on the contract farmer to continue the relationship.

14 IV. ATXI'S STANDARDS AND PROCEDURES ARE INSUFFICIENT

- Q. Why are "ATXI's Standards and Procedures for Construction,
 Repair and Maintenance and Right-of-Ways for the Limestone Ridge Project"
 insufficient?
- A. First, Section I ("Applicability") gives ATXI too much discretion
 regarding whether they will actually implement the standards and
 procedures.

1 Q. Are there issues with the Standards and Procedures

2 "Right-of-Way Acquisition" section?

- 3 A. Yes. It should contain limitations similar to those imposed in EA-
- 4 2016-0358:

1. The certificate is limited to the construction of this line in the 5 6 location specified in the application, and as represented to landowners 7on the aerial photos provided by ATXI, unless a written agreement 8 from the landowner is obtained, or the company gets a variance from 9 the Commission for a particular property, provided, however, minor deviations to the location of the line not exceeding 50^3 feet will be 10 permitted as a result of surveying, final engineering and design, and 11 12landowner consultation, so long as the line and required easements 13stay within the property boundaries of that landowner and do not involve a new landowner. 14

2. Absent a voluntary agreement for the purchase of the property
rights, the transmission line shall not be located so that a residential
structure currently occupied by the property owners will be removed or
located in the easement requirement the owner to move or relocate
from the property.

21 22

15

Q. What is missing from the "Construction and Clearing"

23 section?

A. First, it should contain a provision requiring ATXI to record the number of trees cut down on each parcel and provide landowners the same number of trees from the Missouri Department of Conservation Nursery for planting in alternative locations. Second, it should require ATXI to return

³ This was 500 feet in EA-2016-0358. Given the proximity to our primary residence, this number should be reduced.

1 any artifacts (historical, Native American, etc.) recovered during construction

2 to the landowner.

3 Q. What else is missing from the Standards and Procedures"? A section setting forth "Landowner Interactions" similar to those 4 А. imposed in EA-2016-0358 is missing. Provisions should include: 5 6 1. Every landowner from whom ATXI requires an easement will be 7 contacted personally, and ATXI will negotiate with each such 8 landowner in good faith on the terms and conditions of the easement, 9 its location, and compensation therefore. Each landowner will receive 10 an Easement Agreement pertaining to such landowner's land, which Easement Agreement will contain a drawing that shows the location of 11 12the easement. 13142.After construction is completed, every landowner will be 15contacted personally to ensure construction and clean-up was done 16property, to discuss any concerns, and to settle any damages that have occurred. 1718 193. If a landowner so desires, ATXI will give the landowner a 20reasonable period of time in advance of construction to harvest any timber the landowner desires to harvest. 212223V. THE SCHOLLS' RECOMMENDATIONS 24Q. Why are you asking the Commission to carefully weigh 25"the public interest" in making their decision? 26A. The Commission must consider the "public interest" when 27determining whether a CCN should be issued. Here, the Project imposes 28significant detriments on affected landowners - yet ATXI glosses over the

1	public interest in its Direct Testimony, only looking at the public at large
2	(and their own interests).
3	Q. What conditions would you recommend be imposed to
4	protect landowners?
5	A. The Commission should require ATXI to:
6	1. Rewrite the Easement Agreement to protect landowners
7	interests' as addressed herein;
8	2. Adequately compensate landowners; and
9	3. Order the application of ATXI's Standards and Procedures
10	for Construction, Repair and Maintenance and Right-of-Ways for the
11	Limestone Ridge Project, as modified as suggested herein, as a
12	condition of the CCN.
13	Q. Does this conclude your rebuttal testimony?

Р

14 A. Yes.

ROUTE MAP LIMESTONE RIDGE PROJECT TERRY L SCHOLL AND MARY FRANCES SCHOLL The route depicted on this map is the route ATXI is proposing to utilize for purposes of the project. All PARCEL NUMBER 19-1.0-012-000-000-008.00000 landowners in the study area are advised to stay engaged as the project progresses through siting **PCR 438** ALTENBURG, MO 63732 and regulatory approvals. MAP ID: P48 April 2021 500 Feet Notification Parcel 0 Residence A **Proposed Parcel ROW** 0 Non-residence 1 inch = 400 feet **Final Proposed Centerline** Parcels Final Proposed ROW litizens **Ameren** Wabash Valley POWER ALLIANC

The proposed transmission line requires a 125 feet ROW easement.

LIMESTONE RIDGE PROJECT

ROUTE MAP

TERRY L SCHOLL AND MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

PARCEL NUMBER 19-6.0-013-000-000-003.00000 CHESTNUT OAK LN ALTENBURG, MO 63732 MAP ID: P50 The route depicted on this map is the route ATXI is proposing to utilize for purposes of the project. All landowners in the study area are advised to stay engaged as the project progresses through siting and regulatory approvals.

April 2021



LIMESTONE RIDGE PROJECT

ROUTE MAP

TERRY L SCHOLL AND MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

PARCEL NUMBER 19-6.0-013-000-000-013.00000 HIGHWAY A ALTENBURG, MO 63732 MAP ID: P51 The route depicted on this map is the route ATXI is proposing to utilize for purposes of the project. All landowners in the study area are advised to stay engaged as the project progresses through siting and regulatory approvals.

April 2021



LIMESTONE RIDGE PROJECT

ROUTE MAP

TERRY L SCHOLL AND MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

PARCEL NUMBER 19-6.0-013-000-002.00000 633 CHESTNUT OAK LN ALTENBURG, MO 63732 MAP ID: P42

The route depicted on this map is the route ATXI is proposing to utilize for purposes of the project. All landowners in the study area are advised to stay engaged as the project progresses through siting and regulatory approvals.

April 2021



BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of the Application of Ameren) Transmission Company of Illinois for a Certificate) of Public Convenience and Necessity to Construct,) Install, Own, Operate, Maintain, and Otherwise) Control and Manage a 138 kV Transmission Line) and associated facilities in Perry and Cape) Girardeau Counties, Missouri)

Case No. EA-2021-0087

AFFIDAVIT OF MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

STATE OF MISSOURI)) ss PERRY COUNTY)

Mary Frances Scholl, being first duly sworn on her oath, states:

1. My name Mary Frances Scholl. I live at 633 Chestnut Oak Lane, Altenburg,

Missouri 63732.

2. Attached to this affidavit and made a part hereof for all purposes is my Written Rebuttal Testimony (testimony) on behalf of myself and my husband, Terry "Lin" Scholl. The testimony is <u>20</u> pages and has been prepared in the appropriate format to be introduced into evidence in the case above.

3. I hereby swear and affirm that my answers contained in the attached testimony to

the questions promulgated therein are true and correct.

MARY FRANCES SCHOLL

Sworn to and subscribed before me this 23^{th} day of August, 2021.

JULIE A. FRITSCHE Notary Public - Notary Seal Jotary Public State of Missouri Commissioned for Perry County My Commission Expires: May 31, 2024 Commission Number: 20746691 My commission expires: