## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of the Application of Kansas City	)	
Power & Light Company for Approval to Make	)	
Certain Changes in its Charges for Electric	)	Case No. ER-2010-0355
Service to Continue the Implementation of	)	
Its Regulatory Plan	)	

## **APPLICATION FOR REHEARING**

COMES NOW the Office of the Public Counsel and for its Application for Rehearing respectfully adopts and asserts the following points of error identified by the Midwest Energy Users Association:

- 1. The Commission's Order, as it applies to the issue of Fuel and Purchase Power Expense, represents an unlawful application of the Burden of Proof. Section 393.150(2) expressly provides that the burden of proof shall be on the party advocating for an increased rate. Therefore, as it applies to fuel and purchased power expense, the burden is on Staff to show that its level of fuel and purchased power expense is just and reasonable. To the extent that KCPL later seeks to adopt Staff's level of fuel and purchased power expense, KCPL must accept that same burden of proof. That said, as demonstrated by its orders and deliberations in public session, the Commission abandoned application of this statutory burden of proof and instead simply "gave" KCPL the increased revenue requirement associated with Staff's fuel and purchased power expense.
- 2. The Order is unlawful, unjust and unreasonable in that the Commission has failed, as it applies to the issue of Fuel and Purchased

Power Expense, to provide adequate findings of fact. Labeling recitations of evidence and testimony as findings of fact when they are nothing more than descriptions of what one or the other parties contended do not substitute for findings of fact and has repeatedly been ruled as insufficient by Missouri courts.

- 3. The Order is unlawful, unjust and unreasonable in that the Commission fails to make any finding or decision on the issue denominated "How Should Natural Gas Costs be Determined?" In its Report and Order, the Commission held that it "adopts [KCPL's] method of determining natural gas costs." Suddenly, in its Order of Clarification, the Commission deleted this sentence.<sup>2</sup> Therefore, this contested issue has not been decided by the Commission.
- 4. The Order is unlawful, unjust and unreasonable in that the Commission's decision regarding fuel and purchased power expense (i.e., adoption of the Staff's level of fuel and purchased power) is completely contrary to one of the few Commission findings on this matter. Specifically, in both the Report and Order and in its Order of Clarification, the Commission clearly found that "the MIDAS<sup>TM</sup> model, for which KCP&L argued, is a superior model for determining spot market prices." That said, however, the Commission then inexplicably abandons this finding and adopts Staff's level of fuel and purchased power expense which does not rely on the MIDAS model.

<sup>1</sup> Report and Order, at page 146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Order of Clarification, at page 3.

In fact, as the Commission subsequently recognizes, Staff's method of calculating spot market prices is diametrically opposed to the methodology reflected in the MIDAS model. The MIDAS model relies upon both historical and projected information for determining spot market electric prices. For this reason, the Commission found the MIDAS model to be "superior." On the other hand, Staff's methodology completely ignores projected spot market prices and relies entirely on historical data.

It is illogical (and unlawful and unreasonable) for the Commission to find the MIDAS model to be superior and recite the need to consider projected spot market prices, but then rely upon a Staff methodology that does not use the MIDAS model and only relies upon historical spot market prices. In this case, the Commission's decision (adoption of the Staff level of fuel and purchased power expense) has no logical nexus to the Commission's findings.

5. The Order is unlawful, unjust and unreasonable in that the Commission erroneously concludes that KCPL has "abandoned its true-up testimony position on fuel expense." Based <u>solely</u> upon this erroneous finding, the Commission concludes that Staff's methodology is "more reliable."

KCPL did not "abandon" its position on fuel expense. In fact, in the true-up direct testimony of KCPL witness Weisensee, KCPL notes that "stipulated issues" were trued up in a manner consistent with the previously executed non-unanimous Stipulation and Agreement.<sup>3</sup> Not included in the "stipulated issues" portion of his testimony is the issue of "fuel and purchased power expense."<sup>4</sup> As such, at the time that this testimony was prepared, KCPL did not believe that it had "abandoned" this issue. Furthermore, at the time it offered this testimony into evidence, KCPL did not make any correction to note that it had "abandoned" its position on fuel and purchased power expense. Finally, even at the time that it filed its Initial Brief, KCPL continues to list the four contested fuel and purchased power expense issues:

## F. Fuel & Purchased Power Expense

- 1. How Should Natural Gas Costs be Determined?
- 2. How Should Wolf Creek Fuel Oil Expenses be Determined?
- 3. Should Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission (MJMEUC) Margin be Included in Native Load as well as Off-System Sales Margin?
  - 4. How Should Spot Market Purchased Power Prices be Determined?

Clearly, contrary to the Commission's current finding, at no time did KCPL "abandon" its level of fuel and purchased power expense. Ultimately, given that there are numerous other parties to this proceeding, whether KCPL actually abandoned its level of fuel and purchased power expense is inconsequential to the Commission's obligation to make adequate findings of fact in regards to this issue. As the following section

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ex. 117, Weisensee True-Up Direct, at page 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> *Id.* at page 3.

indicates, the obligation to make these findings of fact is based upon statutory directive.

6. The Order is unlawful, unjust and unreasonable in that the Commission seeks to treat the issue of fuel and purchased power expense as a settled issued between KCPL and Staff. Specifically, the Commission notes that KCPL "adopted Staff's fuel expense amount." Furthermore, repeatedly throughout the April 19 agenda session, individual Commissioners referred to this issue as "settled" between Staff and KCPL.

At best, given that this "settlement" only involved KCPL and Staff, it is a *de facto* non-unanimous Stipulation and Agreement. The Commission has noted, in its rules of practice and procedure, that a non-unanimous Stipulation represents nothing more than "a position of the signatory parties."

In 1982, the Court of Appeals addressed the Commission's responsibility as it pertains to the consideration of a non-unanimous Stipulation. In the case of *State ex rel. Fischer v. Public Service Commission*, 6 the Court held that the Commission may not simply adopt the position contained in the non-unanimous Stipulation. Rather, when confronted with a non-unanimous Stipulation, the Commission must implement the full hearing procedure. Included in this procedure are requirements related to the contents of the Commission's order.

This section also states that whenever the Commission makes an investigation, it shall be its duty to make a report in writing in respect

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> 4 CSR 240-2.115(2)(D).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> 645 S.W.2d 39 (Mo.App. 1982).

thereto, which shall state the conclusions of the commission, together with its decision, order or requirement in the premises. In <u>State ex rel. Rice v. Public Service Commission</u>, the court stated that this statute required the Commission to include findings of fact in all of its written reports.<sup>7</sup>

Thus, the Commission cannot simply allow KCPL to adopt Staff's position over the objection of other parties. Rather, the Commission is required to make findings of fact as to all disputed issues.

Indeed, at least one Commissioner, relying in part on the holding of the *Fischer* court, has stated his opinion that the responsibility to make adequate findings of fact does not only extend to cases in which the Commission considers a non-unanimous Stipulation and Agreement, but also extends to situations in which the Commission considers a Unanimous Stipulation and Agreement.

Section 536.090 allows the Commission to issue decisions in contested cases when they are disposed of by stipulation without separately stating findings of fact and conclusions of law. Nevertheless, this does not relieve the Commission of its statutory duty to evaluate the facts and make a conclusion that the agreement provides for just and reasonable rates, provides for safe and adequate service, and is in the public interest. The signatories to the agreement may believe that it does, but the Commission must decide if this is so based upon the factual record. Missouri Courts, interpreting Section 386.420, have held that in contested cases (proceedings in which legal rights, duties or privileges of specific parties are required to be determined after hearing) the Commission must include findings of fact in its written report. Merely adopting a stipulation and agreement is insufficient and does not satisfy the competent and substantial evidence standard embodied in the Missouri Constitution, Article V, Section 18. Consequently, the law requires the Commission to include separately stated findings of fact and conclusions of law supporting its decision in this matter.<sup>8</sup>

\_

 $<sup>^{7}</sup>$  *Id*. at 42

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Concurring Opinion of Commissioner Terry M. Jarrett, Case No. ER-2010-0130, issued May 19, 2010, at pages 1-2. (emphasis added, citations omitted).

Despite the statutory requirements and the direction of the *Fischer* court, the Commission has neglected its duty to make adequate findings of fact in this case based simply on the belief that, because it had adopted Staff's position, KCPL had "abandoned" its true-up position. As Commissioner Jarrett has correctly noted, however, "this does not relieve the Commission of its statutory duty to evaluate the facts." As pertains to the issue of fuel and purchased power expense, the Commission has not met its statutory duty.

WHEREFORE, the Office of the Public Counsel respectfully requests that the Commission grant rehearing of its April 12, 2011 Report and Order and its April 19, 2011 Order of Clarification for the purpose of addressing the points raised herein.

Respectfully submitted,

OFFICE OF THE Public Counsel

/s/ Lewis R. Mills, Jr.

> Public Counsel P O Box 2230

Jefferson City, MO 65102 (573) 751-1304

(573) 751-1304 (573) 751-5562 FAX

lewis.mills@ded.mo.gov

7

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing have been mailed, emailed or hand-delivered to the following this 21st day of April 2011:

General Counsel Office Missouri Public Service Commission 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 GenCounsel@psc.mo.gov

Mills Lewis Office of the Public Counsel Missouri Public Service 200 Madison Street, Suite 650 P.O. Box 2230 Jefferson City, MO 65102 opcservice@ded.mo.gov

Williams Nathan Commission 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 Nathan.Williams@psc.mo.gov

Deutsch B James Missouri Retailers Association 308 E High St., Ste. 301 Jefferson City, MO 65101 jdeutsch@blitzbardgett.com

Schwarz R Thomas Missouri Retailers Association 308 E High Street, Ste. 301 Jefferson City, MO 65101 tschwarz@blitzbardgett.com Washington, DC 20585

Bruder P Arthur National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA) - K.C. 1000 Independence Ave. SW arthur.bruder@hq.doe.gov

LeBlanc Therese National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA) - K.C. Plant 2000 E. 95th St. P.O. Box 419159 Kansas City, MO 64141 tleblanc@kcp.com

Porter A Steven National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA) -K.C. Plant 1000 Independence Ave. SW Washington, DC 20585 steven.porter@hq.doe.gov Sader S Neil North Kansas City Hospital 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James North Kansas City Hospital 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Woodsmall David Praxair. Inc. 428 E. Capitol Ave., Suite 300 Jefferson City, MO 65101 dwoodsmall@fcplaw.com Conrad Stuart Praxair. Inc. 3100 Broadway, Suite 1209 Kansas City, MO 64111 stucon@fcplaw.com

Sader S Neil Research Medical Center 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 750 Commerce Plaza II Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Research Medical Center 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210jim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil Research Psychiatric Center 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Sader S Neil Saint Luke's Cancer Institute 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 750 Commerce Plaza II Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210jim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil Saint Luke's Cancer Institute Saint Luke's Health System 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Saint Luke's Health System 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil Saint Luke's Hospital of Kansas City 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com Zakoura P James Saint Luke's Hospital of Kansas 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 iim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil Saint Luke's Northland Hospital -**Barry Road Campus** 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 Campus Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Saint Luke's Northland Hospital - Barry Road 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Zakoura P James Saint Luke's Northland Hospital - Smithville Campus 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil St. Joseph Medical Center 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 750 Commerce Plaza II Kansas Citv. MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James St. Joseph Medical Center 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210jim@smizak-law.com

Sader S Neil Truman Medical Center, Inc. 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Truman Medical Center, Inc. 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Lowery B James Union Electric Company 111 South Ninth St., Suite P.O. Box 918 Columbia, MO 65205-0918 lowery@smithlewis.com

**Bvrne M Thomas** Union Electric Company 1901 Chouteau Avenue P.O. Box 66149 (MC 1310) St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 AmerenMOService@ameren.co

Tatro Wendy Union Electric Company 1901 Chouteau Avenue St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 AmerenMOService@ameren.com Bruder P Arthur LeBlanc Therese United States Department of United States Department of Energy 1000 Independence Ave. SW

Energy 2000 E. 95th St. P.O. Box 419159 Kansas City, MO 64141 tleblanc@kcp.com

Porter A Steven United States Department of Energy 1000 Independence Ave, SW Washington, DC 20585 steven.porter@hq.doe.gov

Coffman B John AARP 871 Tuxedo Blvd. St. Louis, MO 63119-2044 john@johncoffman.net

Washington, DC 20585

arthur.bruder@hq.doe.gov

Sader S Neil Carondelet Health 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Carondelet Health 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Comley W Mark 601 Monroe Street., Suite 301 P.O. Box 537 Jefferson City, MO 65102-0537

comleym@ncrpc.com

Coffman B John City of Kansas City, Missouri Consumers Council of Missouri 871 Tuxedo Blvd. St. Louis, MO 63119-2044 iohn@iohncoffman.net

Department Legal County of Jackson, Missouri 415 E. 12th Street Kansas City, MO 64106

Sader S Neil 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 Kansas City, MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James Crittenton Children's Center Crittenton Children's Center 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Lumley J Carl Dogwood Energy, LLC 130 S. Bemiston, Ste 200 St. Louis, MO 63105 clumley@lawfirmemail.com

Cooper L Dean **Empire District Electric** Company, The 312 East Capitol P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 dcooper@brydonlaw.com

Carter C Diana **Empire District Electric** Company, The 312 E. Capitol Avenue P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 DCarter@brydonlaw.com

Swearengen C James Empire District Electric Company, The 312 East Capitol Avenue P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 LRackers@brydonlaw.com

Mitten Russ **Empire District Electric** Company, The 312 E. Capitol Ave P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 rmitten@brydonlaw.com

Bruder P Arthur Federal Executive Agencies 1000 Independence Ave. SW Washington, DC 20585 arthur.bruder@hq.doe.gov

LeBlanc Therese Federal Executive Agencies 2000 E. 95th St. P.O. Box 419159 Kansas City, MO 64141 tleblanc@kcp.com

Porter A Steven Federal Executive Agencies 1000 Independence Ave, SW Washington, DC 20585 steven.porter@hq.doe.gov

Vuylsteke M Diana Ford Motor Company 211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102 dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

Sader S Neil HCA Midwest Health System 4739 Belleview Avenue, Suite 300 System Kansas Citv. MO 64112-1364 nsader@sadergarvin.com

Zakoura P James **HCA Midwest Health** 750 Commerce Plaza II 7400 West 110th Street Overland Park, KS 66210-2362 jim@smizak-law.com

Amash E Michael IBEW Local Union 1464 753 State Ave. Suite 475 Kansas City, KS 66101 mea@blake-uhlig.com

Waers James Richard IBEW Local Union 1464 753 State Avenue, Suite 475 Kansas City, KS 66101 jrw@blake-uhlig.com

Amash E Michael IBEW Local Union 1613 753 State Ave, Suite 475 Kansas City, KS 66101 mea@blake-uhlig.com

Waers James Richard IBEW Local Union 1613 753 State Avenue, Suite 475 Kansas City, KS 66101 jrw@blake-uhlig.com

Amash E Michael IBEW Local Union 412 753 State Ave, Suite 475 Kansas City, KS 66101 mea@blake-uhlig.com

Waers James Richard IBEW Local Union 412 753 State Avenue, Suite 475 Company Kansas City, KS 66101 jrw@blake-uhlig.com

Cafer Glenda Kansas City Power & Light 3321 SW 6th Ave Topeka, KS 66606 gcafer@sbcglobal.net

Cunningham B Susan Kansas City Power & Light Company 7028 SW 69th Street Auburn, KS 66402 susan.cunningham@snrdenton.co lisa.gilbreath@snrdenton.co jfischerpc@aol.com m

Gilbreath A Lisa Kansas City Power & Light Company 4520 Main, Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64111 m

Fischer M James Kansas City Power & Light Company 101 Madison Street, Suite 400 Jefferson City, MO 65101

Dority W Larry Kansas City Power & Light Company 101 Madison, Suite 400 Jefferson City, MO 65101 lwdority@sprintmail.com

Gibb C Daniel Kansas City Power & Light Company 4520 Main Street, Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64111 dan.gibb@snrdenton.com

Humphrey A Heather Kansas City Power & Light Company 1200 Main PO Box 418679 Kansas City, MO 64141-9679 Heather.Humphrey@kcpl.com

Zobrist Karl Kansas City Power & Light Company 4520 Main Street, Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64111 karl.zobrist@snrdenton.com

Steiner W Roger Kansas City Power & Light Company 1200 Main Street, 16th Floor 230 W. McCarty Street P.O. Box 418679 Kansas City, MO 64105-9679 roger.steiner@kcpl.com

Hatfield W Charles Kansas City Power & Light Company Jefferson City, MO 65101-1553 chatfield@stinson.com

Woodsmall David Midwest Energy Users' Association 428 E. Capitol Ave., Suite 300 Jefferson City, MO 65101 dwoodsmall@fcplaw.com

Finnegan D Jeremiah Midwest Energy Users' Association 3100 Broadway, Suite 1209 Kansas City, MO 64111 ifinnegan@fcplaw.com

Conrad Stuart Midwest Energy Users' Association 3100 Broadway, Suite 1209 Kansas City, MO 64111 stucon@fcplaw.com

Mangelsdorf B Sarah Missouri Department of Natural Resources 207 West High St. P.O. Box 899 Jefferson City, MO 65102 sarah.mangelsdorf@ago.mo.gov

Young Mary Ann Missouri Department of Natural Resources 1101 Riverside Drive, 4th Floor East, Rm. 456 Jefferson City, MO 65109maryann.young@dnr.mo.go Cooper L Dean Missouri Gas Energy 312 East Capitol P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 dcooper@brydonlaw.com

Jacobs J Todd Missouri Gas Energy 3420 Broadway Kansas City, MO 64111 todd.jacobs@sug.com

Noack R Michael Missouri Gas Energy 3420 Broadway Kansas City, MO 64111 mike.noack@sug.com

Vuylsteke M Diana Missouri Industrial Energy Consumers 211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102 dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

Healy Douglas Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission 939 Boonville Suite A Springfield, MO 65802 doug@healylawoffices.com

Kincheloe E Duncan Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission 1808 I-70 Dr. SW Columbia, MO 65203 dkincheloe@mpua.org

/s/ Lewis R. Mills, Jr.